

SWANLEY MARKET TENDER EVALUATION SUMMARY

WEDNESDAY MARKET Combined Value for Money and Quality Scores

Tender No.	Tenderer	Value for money (max. 60)	Technical Merit (max. 15)	Suitability as a Business (max. 4)	Assessed Capability (max. 17)	Complete Response (max. 4)	TOTAL (max. 100)	
1	Hughmark Ltd.	47	10	3	13	2	75	Non-compliant tender
2	Bray Associates	49	10	4	15	3	81	

Award Recommendation to Portfolio-holder:

Although the tender submitted by Hughmark Ltd has been evaluated and scored under the notified evaluation headings of Value for Money and Quality, it has been established through the tender enquiry process that this tender is non-compliant as the annual licence fees quoted are a projection of potential income rather than the firm annual fee payable under the contract. Hughmark Limited have declined to carry the risk of under-recovery in pitch fees but say the risk of under-recovery for the Council is low and that the potential income to the Council could be substantially more. Sevenoaks District Council is unable to accept this alternative tender without retendering and as such it must be disregarded.

Therefore the most economically advantageous compliant tender in accordance with the evaluation criteria is that submitted by Bray Associates. It is recommended that tenderers be advised of the tender outcome and that, subject to there being no challenge during the ten-day standstill period required under EU tender rules, the contract for the Swanley market operation, commencing 1st April 2019 until 31st March 2023, be awarded to Ritagate Limited trading as Bray Associates.

Swanley Market Tender - Evaluation Criteria - Value for Money Scores

Wednesday Market

Tender price for first year (initial fee)

Whole contract period including any possible extension

Assumes 2% annual CPI increase as calculated below

Apply Annual CPI increases

To calculate the total value of the market fees paid, at the same rate of annual CPI inflation: = $P*(1+r)$ where,

P is the initial amount;

r is the annual interest rate as a percentage;

Possible variations due to loss of Square market area

Overall income - Lot 1 for 1 year and Lot 2 for 4 years

Overall income - Lot 1 for 2 years and Lot 2 for 3 years

Overall income - Lot 1 for 3 years and Lot 2 for 2 years

Overall income - Lot 1 for 4 years and Lot 2 for 1 year

Overall income - Lot 1 for 5 years

Scores - Maximum 60

First year income to the Council combined Lots - Max. score 10

Variations in overall income due to loss of market area for the whole contract period incl. extension - Total Max. score 40

Guarantee of regular monthly income - risk of fluctuation in income due to stall-holder non-attendance carried by Contractor or SDC? - Max. score 10

Total Value for Money Score =

	Hughmark Limited		Bray Associates	
	Lot 1	Lot 2	Lot 1	Lot 2
Tender price for first year (initial fee)			£320,000	£245,000
Whole contract period including any possible extension			£1,665,293	£1,274,990
Assumes 2% annual CPI increase as calculated below				
Apply Annual CPI increases	Y1		£320,000	£245,000
To calculate the total value of the market fees paid, at the same rate of annual CPI inflation: = $P*(1+r)$ where,	Y2		£326,400	£249,900
P is the initial amount;	Y3		£332,928	£254,898
r is the annual interest rate as a percentage;	Y4		£339,587	£259,996
	ExY5		£346,378	£265,196
Possible variations due to loss of Square market area				
Overall income - Lot 1 for 1 year and Lot 2 for 4 years	Var. 1		£1,349,990	-£4,425
Overall income - Lot 1 for 2 years and Lot 2 for 3 years	Var. 2		£1,426,490	£3,164
Overall income - Lot 1 for 3 years and Lot 2 for 2 years	Var. 3		£1,504,520	£10,904
Overall income - Lot 1 for 4 years and Lot 2 for 1 year	Var. 4		£1,584,110	£18,800
Overall income - Lot 1 for 5 years	Var. 5		£1,665,293	£26,853
Scores - Maximum 60				
First year income to the Council combined Lots - Max. score 10		9		7
Variations in overall income due to loss of market area for the whole contract period incl. extension - Total Max. score 40	Var. 1	6		8
	Var. 2	8		6
	Var. 3	8		6
	Var. 4	8		6
	Var. 5	8		6
Guarantee of regular monthly income - risk of fluctuation in income due to stall-holder non-attendance carried by Contractor or SDC? - Max. score 10		0		10
Total Value for Money Score =		47		49

Swanley Market Tender - Evaluation Criteria - Quality Scores	<i>Maximum Score</i>	Hughmark Limited	Comments	Bray Associates	Comments
Technical merit.					
Compliance with the Specification and Tender. Together with an acceptable integration process	3	2	Insurances will need to be increased. Says previous market operator so should allow successful integration.	3	Current market operator knows requirements allowing successful integration.
Method statements.	5	4	Broad method statements	2	Short method statements
Demonstrated Health and Safety Compliance	5	2	Limited demonstration	3	First hand demonstration
Technical back up and support	2	2	Directors attend market days	2	Current market Operator
Sub-Total	15	10		10	
Suitability as a business					
Flexibility on contract conditions.	2	1	Untested so unknown	2	Current market Operator
Ability to work with the Council	2	2	Previous Swanley Operator?	2	Current market Operator
Sub-Total	4	3		4	
Assessed capability					
Assessed capability of tenderer to support all elements of the contract	3	2	SME Market Operator	3	Multiple Market Operator
Monitoring and dealing with complaints.	3	2	Untested so unknown	2	Response to 'valid' complaints
Evaluation of reference sites	3	2	Works with Thanet DC	3	Current market Operator
Assessed ability to comply with Heads of Terms	3	3	Previous Swanley Operator	3	Current market Operator
Level of experience both directly and indirectly of tenderers staff who will oversee and implement the contract	3	3	Directors will attend and have multiple markets experience	3	Director and attending manager have multiple markets experience
Training and development of staff.	2	1	In-house - Directors train	1	In-house
Sub-Total	17	13		15	
Completeness of Response					
Assessed completeness of response.	2	1	No H&S policy or other docs.	1	No H&S policy or other docs.
Any social value added	2	1	Untested so unknown	2	Supports charity & SDC stalls
Sub-Total	4	2		3	
Total	40	28		32	